#### Court File No. CV-21-00657656-00CCL

## ONTARIO SUPERIOR COURT OF JUSTICE

BETWEEN:

#### THE TORONTO DOMINION BANK

**Plaintiffs** 

- and -

#### BRAD DUBY PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

Defendants

APPLICATION UNDER SUBSECTION 243(1) OF THE BANKRUPTCY AND INSOLVENCY ACT, R.S.C. 1985, C. B-3, AS AMENDED, AND SECTION 101 OF THE

COURTS OF JUSTICE ACT, R.S.O. 1990 C. C.43, AS AMENDED

RESPONDING MOTION RECORD OF NEW COUNSEL ALEXANIAN LAW FIRM (In Writing)

October 3, 2022 ALEXANIAN LAW FIRM

1018 Finch Avenue West

Suite 103

Toronto, ON M3J 3L5

Shahen A. Alexanian Tel: 416-888-1500 Fax: 416-888-5070

New Counsel

TO: McLEISH ORLANDO LLP 151 Yonge Street, Suite 1800 Toronto, ON, M5C 2W7

LINDSAY CHARLES

E-mail: lcharles@mollp.com

Tel.: 416-366-3311

## AND TO: HARRISON PENSA LLP

Barristers & Solicitors

130 Dufferin Avenue, Suite 1101

London, ON N6A 5R2

## Attention: Timothy C. Hogan & Robert Danter

Email: thogan@harrisonpensa.com & rdanter@harrisonpensa.com

Tel: 519-679-9660 Fax: 519-667-3362

Lawyers for the Receiver, MNP Ltd.

#### AND TO: AIRD & BERLIS LLP

Brookfield Place 181 Bay Street, Suite 1800 Toronto, ON M5J 2T9

## **Attention: Kyle Plunkett & Nathan Gates**

Tel: (416) 863-1500

Email: kplunkett@airdberlis.com and ngates@airdberlis.com

Lawyers for the Applicant, Toronto-Dominion Bank

#### AND TO: MNP LTD.

111 Richmond Street West, Suite 300 Toronto, ON M5H 2G4

## **Attention: Matthew Lem**

Tel: (416) 515-388

Email: matthew.lem@mnp.ca

Receiver

#### AND TO: JAFFE PERITZ LLP

100 Richmond Street West, Suite 424 Toronto, ON M5H 3K6

#### **Attention: Brandon Jaffe & Elaine Peritz**

Tel: (416) 368-2809 ext. 101

Email: bjaffe@jaffeperitz.com and eperitz@jaffeperitz.com

Lawyers for Bridgepoint Financial Services

AND TO: LAW SOCIETY OF ONTARIO

393 University Avenue, Suite 1100

Toronto, ON M5G 1E6

**Attention: Adam Di Federico** 

Tel: (437) 9297285 Email: AFederic@lso.ca

Lawyers for the Law Society of Ontario

AND TO: SOMOGYI LAW GROUP

758 Sheppard Avenue West North York, ON M3H 2S8

Attention: Adam A. Somogyi

Tel: (416) 941-2502 Email: adam@slcilegal.ca

New Counsel

AND TO: PRESZLER INJURY LAWYERS

151 Eglington Avenue West Toronto, ON M4R 1A6

Attention: Jeffrey A. Preszler
Tel: (416) 364-2000 ext. 221
Email: jpreszler@preszlerlaw.com

New Counsel

AND TO: AARON WAXMAN AND ASSOCIATES

1120 Finch Avenue West, #500 Toronto, ON M3J 3H7

Attention: Michael Hazan & Aaron Waxman

Tel: (416) 661-4878

Email: mhazan@awaxmanlaw.ca and awaxman@awaxmanlaw.ca

AND TO: NAIMARK LAW FIRM

141 Adelaide Street West, Suite #330

Toronto, ON M5H 3L5

Attention: Ryan Naimark & Nergiz Sinjari

Tel: (416) 366-7246

Email: ryan@naimarklaw.com and nsinjari@naimarklaw.com

New Counsel

AND TO: LEE & ASSOCIATES PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

4950 Yonge Street, #2000 North York, ON M2N 6K1

Attention: Raffi Akelian

Tel: (416) 782-8168

Email: rakelian@leeassociates.ca

**New Counsel** 

AND TO: D'ALESSIO ROMERO LAW FIRM

204-3100 Rutherford Road Vaughan, ON L4K 0G6

Attention: Elio D'Alessio

Tel: (905) 417-1777

Email: edalessio@dalessioromero.com

**New Counsel** 

AND TO: HOWIE, SACKS & HENRY LLP

20 Queen Street West, Suite 3500

Toronto, ON M5H 3R3

**Attention: James Howie & Brad Moscato** 

Tel: (416) 361-5990

Email: jrhowie@hshlawyers.com and bmoscato@hshlawyers.com

## AND TO: MK LEGAL SERVICES PROFESSION CORPORATION

1110 Finch Ave. W., Suite 205

Toronto, ON M3J 2T2

Attention: Shahen A. Alexanian

Tel: (416) 650-0060

Email: shahen@mklegal.ca

New Counsel

#### AND TO: BERGMANIS PREYRA LLP

2926 Dundas Street West Toronto, ON M6P 1Y8

Attention: Joel McCoy, Kurt Bergmanis and Frank Piazza

Tel: (416) 256-1700

Email: JMcCoy@bplawyers.ca, FPiazza@bplawyers.ca and

KBergmanis@bplawyers.ca

**New Counsel** 

## AND TO: GREAT OAK VFA INC.

1280 Finch Avenue West, Suite #408 Toronto, ON M3J 3K6

Attention: Christine Connell Tel: (416) 455-5600 ext. 107 Email: cconnell@greatoakvfa.ca

Creditor

## AND TO: Q MEDICAL

1500 Don Mills Road, Unit 403 North York, ON M3B 3K4

Tel: (416) 901-0054 Email: info@q-medical.ca

Creditor

AND TO: CHORNEY SIDHU INJURY LAWYERS

2 Automatic Road, Unit 105 Brampton, ON L65 6K8

Attention: Melissa Sidhu & Savannah Chorney

Tel: (844) 487-8482

Email: melissachornevlawyers.com and savannahchorneylawyers.com

New Counsel

AND TO: HIMELFARB PROSZNANSKI BARRISTERS & SOLICITORS

480 University Avenue, #1401

Toronto, ON M5G 1V2

**Attention: Katherine Lee and David Himelfarb** 

Tel: (416) 599-8080 Ext. 292

Email: klee@himprolaw.com and dhimelfarb@himprolaw.com

Lawyers for ARCG Inc.

AND TO: DENTONS CANADA LLP

77 King Street West, Suite 400

Toronto-Dominion Centre Toronto, ON M5K 0A1

**Attention: Meredith Bacal** 

Tel: (416) 863 4395

Email: Meredith.bacal@dentons.com

Lawyers for Easy Legal Finance Inc.

AND TO: ALLAN ROUBEN BARRISTER & SOLICITOR

70 Bond Street, #200 Toronto, ON M5B 1X3

**Attention: Allan Rouben** 

Tel: (416) 360-5444

Email: arouben@bellnet.ca

Lawyers for Lifeline Litigation Loans Inc.

AND TO: MINISTRY OF FINANCE (ONTARIO)

Insolvency Unit 33 King Street West, 6th Floor

Oshawa, ON L1H 8H5

Email: insolvency.unitontario.ca

AND TO: DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (CANADA)

The Exchange Tower 3400-130 King Street West

P.O. Box 36 Toronto, ON M5X 1K6

**Attention: Diane Winters** 

Tel: (416) 973-3172

Email: diane.winters@justice.gc.ca

**Ontario Regional Office** 

Email: torbankruptcy@justice.gc.ca

AND TO: ALAMGIR LAW PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

2401 Eglinton Ave. East, Suite 209

Scarborough, ON M1K 2N8

**Attention: Alangir Hussain** 

Tel: (416) 755-4000

Email: law@alamgirlaw.com

New Counsel

AND TO: ALLAN B. SHUSTERMAN

Solicitor and Barrister

3320 Midland Ave., Suite 207

Toronto, ON M1V 5E6

Attention: Allan B. Shusterman

Tel: (416) 291-6176

Email: alshus@hotmail.com

## AND TO: ANUSHIKA ANTHONY PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

268 Queen Street West Brampton, ON L6X 1B1

**Attention: Anushika Anthony** 

Tel: (905) 874-7011

Email: info@aapclawyers.com

New Counsel

## AND TO: BERGEL, MAGENCE LLP

1018 Finch Avenue West, 5th Floor Toronto, ON M3J 3L5

Attention: Ilan Bergel & Nashmil Mamresuli

Tel: (416) 665-2000 ext. 214

Email: ibergel@bergellaw.com and nmamresuli@bergellaw.com

**New Counsel** 

## AND TO: CAMPISI LLP

7050 Weston Rd., Suite 101 Vaughan, ON L4L 8G7

**Attention: Joseph Campisi** 

Tel: (416) 203-1115

Email: info@campisilaw.ca

**New Counsel** 

## AND TO: DAVID HOLLINGSWORTH PERSONAL INJURY LAWYERS

176 Bronson Avenue Ottawa, ON K1R 6H4

**Attention: David Hollingsworth** 

Tel: (613) 237-4922

Email: david@ottawainjury.ca

## AND TO: DAVID S. WILSON PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

2000-393 University Ave. Toronto, ON M5G 1E6

**Attention: David Wilson** 

Tel: (416) 943-1223

Email: dswilson@davidswilsonlaw.com

New Counsel

## AND TO: DESAI MARUSZKI LLP

4789 Yonge St., Suite 520 Toronto, ON M2N 0G3

Attention: lan Miller Tel: (416) 848-4570

Email: ian@desaimaruszki.com

**New Counsel** 

## AND TO: DIAMOND & DIAMOND LAWYERS

255 Consumers Rd. Suite 5 Toronto, ON M2J 1R4

**Attention: Jill Carrington** 

Tel: (416) 256-1600

Email: jcarrington@diamondlaw.ca

**New Counsel** 

## AND TO: GERALD STERNBERG

469 Lawrence Ave. West North York, ON M5M 106

**Attention: Gerald Sternberg** 

Tel: (416) 967-0077

Email: derald.sternberca@bellnet.ca

AND TO: GIRONES LAWYERS

300-300 Terry Fox. Dr. Kanata, ON K2K 0E3

**Attention: Andrea Girones** 

Tel: (613) 599-3535

Email: agirones@girones.ca

New Counsel

AND TO: GOODMAN ELBASSIOUNI LLP

190 Attwell Drive, Suite 300 Toronto, ON M9W 6H8

**Attention: Corey Goodman** 

Tel: (905) 265-1005

Email: corey@goodmanlawgroup.ca

**New Counsel** 

AND TO: GOSAI LAW PROFESSIONAL FIRM

8770 The Gore Road, Unit 2 Brampton, ON L6P OBI

Attention: Nital S. Gosai

Tel: (905) 595-2225

Email: info@gosailaw.com

**New Counsel** 

AND TO: GREG MONFORTON AND PARTNERS

1 Riverside Drive West, Suite 1

Windsor, ON N9A 5K3

**Attention: Jennifer Bezaire** 

Tel: (866) 320-4770

Email: ibezairegregmonforton.com

AND TO: HIMELFARB PROSZANSKI LLP

480 University Avenue, Suite 1401

Toronto, ON M5G 1V2

**Attention: David Himelfarb** 

Tel: (877) 820-1210

Email: dhimelfarb@himprolaw.com

New Counsel

AND TO: JEFFREY SHINEHOFT PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

80 Bloor St. West Toronto, ON M5S 2V1

**Attention: Jeffrey Shinehoft** 

Tel: (416) 551-9060

Email: jeffrey@jslawfirm.ca

**New Counsel** 

AND TO: JOSHUA GOLDBERG LAW

500 King Street West, Suite 300

Toronto, ON M5V 1L9

**Attention: Joshua Goldberg** 

Tel: (416) 943-6502

Email: joshua@jgoldberglaw.ca

New Counsel

AND TO: JUZKIW LAW PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

4750 Yonge Street, Suite 346 North York, ON M2N 0J6

Attention: Stefan Roman Juzkiw

Tel: (416) 290-5055

Email: stefan@juzkiw.com

AND TO: KRYLOV LAM & COMPANY LLP

25 Sheppard Ave. West, Suite 15

North York, ON M2N 6S6

**Attention: Joseph Lam** 

Tel: (416) 649-0000 Email: jlam@krylaw.ca

New Counsel

AND TO: LAW OFFICES OF BARRY A. EDSON

10018 Finch Ave. West, Unit 100

North York, ON M3J 3L5

**Attention: Barry A. Edson** 

Tel: (855) 702-3119

Email: bedson@edsonlegal.com

New Counsel

AND TO: LEONE MURRAY LLP

130 Queens Quay East Toronto, ON M5A 0P6

**Attention: James Leone** 

Tel: (416) 363-5151

Email: james@leonemurray.com

New Counsel

AND TO: LUBMAN & ASSOCIATES PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

920 Sheppard Ave. West Toronto, ON M3H 0A2

Attention: Tina Lubman

Tel: (416) 633-5868

Email: tina@lubmanlaw.ca

AND TO: MACISAAC GOW LLP

1100 Central Parkway West, Suite 37-1

Mississauga, ON L5C 4E5

Attention: Fraser Gow Tel: (365) 777-4878

Email: fgow@mglawyers.ca

New Counsel

AND TO: MAZO CHOWBAY LLP

4711 Yonge Street, Suite 902

Toronto, ON M2N 6K8

Attention: Alisa Mazo

Tel: (647) 430-0347

Email: alisa.mazo@mazochowbay.com

**New Counsel** 

AND TO: NEINSTEIN LLP

700-1200 Bay St.

Toronto, ON M5R 2A5

**Attention: Erik Joffe** 

Tel: (416) 920-4242

Email: erik@neinstein.com

New Counsel

AND TO: OPALINSKI LAW

500 King Street West, Suite 3

Toronto, ON M5V 1L9

**Attention: Barbara Opalinski** 

Tel: (416) 825-9901

Email: barbara©opalinskilaw.ca

AND TO: PA LAW FIRM PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

4022 Sheppard Ave. East Scarborough, ON MIS 1S6

Tel: (416) 321-3338

AND TO: PACE LAW FIRM

191 The West Mall, Suite 1100

Toronto, ON M9C 5K8

**Attention: Allan Chapnik** 

Tel: (877) 236-3060

Email: achapnik@pacelawfirm.com

**New Counsel** 

AND TO: PILIECI LEGAL SERVICES

2450 Finch Ave. West North York, ON M9M 2E9

**Attention: Michael Pilieci** 

Tel: (416) 878-2838

Email: piliecilegalservices@outlook.com

New Counsel

AND TO: POLLACK TSIMERMAN LLP

2450 Victoria Park Ave., Suite 401

North York, ON M2J 4A2

**Attention: Ziv Tsimerman** 

Tel: (416) 491-0111

Email: ztsimerman@ptlawyers.ca

New Counsel

AND TO: RAYMOND LEE HATHAWAY, PARALEGAL

42-656 Yonge St. Toronto, ON M4Y 2A6

**Attention: Raymond Lee Hathaway** 

Tel: (647) 620-4420 Fax: (416) 741-2806

AND TO: SHARMA LAW

205 Main Street South Newmarket, ON L3Y 3Y9

**Attention: Vishal Sharma** 

Tel: (647) 849-4818

Email: sharma@vsharmalaw.ca

New Counsel

AND TO: SIGANPORIA LAW FIRM

1370 Don Mills Rd. Toronto, ON M3B 3N7

**Attention: Faranaz Siganporia** 

Tel: (416) 900-3841 Email: faranaz@siglaw.ca

**New Counsel** 

AND TO: SOKOLOFF LAWYERS

120 Scollard Street Toronto, ON M5R 1G2

**Attention: Wendy Sokoloff** 

Tel: (416) 966-4878

Email: wendy@sokoloff.ca

New Counsel

AND TO: TSD LAW

93 Skyway Ave., Suite 111 Etobicoke, ON M9W 6N6

Attention: Tanveer S. Dhillon

Tel: (647) 346-3340 Email: info@tsdlaw.ca

AND TO: VATURI & CHO LLP

1110 Finch Ave. W., Unit 310

Toronto, ON M3J 2T2

**Attention: Jae Hyon Cho** 

Tel: (416) 661-4529

Email: jcho@vclawyers.ca

New Counsel

AND TO: WAKELIN & ASSOCIATES LLP

1-605 Brock Street South Whitby, ON L1 N 4L1

**Attention: John Wakelin** 

Tel: (416) 227-3444

Email: lindsays@wakelinlaw.com

**New Counsel** 

AND TO: AMURJUEV LAW PC

Barrister and Solicitor

1 Yonge Street, Suite 1801 Toronto, ON M5E 1W7

**Attention: Michael Amurjuev** 

Tel: (416) 357-0864

Email: amurjuevlaw@gmail.com

New Counsel, Counsel for Kerwin Deschamps

AND TO: ZAFAR LAW FIRM PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

33 City Centre Drive, Suite 606 Mississauga, ON L5B 2N5

**Attention: Muhammad Zafar** 

Tel: (905) 232-4545

Email: info@zafarlawfirm.com

AND TO: ZWIEBEL & ASSOCIATES

29 Bangor Road

North York, ON M2N 2J8

**Attention: Thomas W. Zwiebel** 

Tel: (416) 221-9777

Email: dwilson@zwiebelandassociates.ca

**New Counsel** 

AND TO: VERKHOVETS LAW PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

3300 Hwy 7, Unit 403 Vaughan, ON L4K 4M3

**Attention: Mariya Verkhovets** 

Tel: (905) 910-1440

Email: infoverkhovetslaw.com

## Court File No. CV-21-00657656-00CCL

# ONTARIO SUPERIOR COURT OF JUSTICE

BETWEEN:

## TORONTO-DOMINION BANK

Plaintiff

- and -

## BRAD DUBY PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

Defendants

## **INDEX**

- 1. Affidavit of Parisa Babadi
  - A. Emails between Mr. Alexanian and Mr. Hogan
  - B. Statement of Claim against Brad Duby

Court File No. CV-21-00657656-00CCL

ONTARIO
SUPERIOR COURT OF JUSTICE

BETWEEN:

#### THE TORONTO DOMINION BANK

Plaintiff

- and -

#### BRAD DUBY PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

Defendants

#### AFFIDAVIT OF PARISA BABADI

- I, Parisa Babadi, of the City of Toronto, in the Province of Ontario, MAKE OATH AND SAY AS FOLLOWS:
  - I am a law clerk at Alexanian Law Firm/MK Legal, counsel for the Plaintiffs and as such I have knowledge of the matters hereinafter deposed to. Unless I indicate to the contrary, the matters to which I depose are within my personal knowledge and belief.
     Where information has been obtained from third parties, I do verily believe that information to be true.
  - After the unfortunate passing of Mr. Duby, our firm was retained by over 30 of Mr. Duby's former clients (the "transferred clients") in respect of their motor vehicle accident tort claims.
  - 3. Many of the transferred clients are displeased with the service they received from Mr. Duby's office, and wish to have his account, when/if provided, assessed. Some clients

- are willing to negotiate with Mr. Duby regarding his account, when/if provided. None of the transferred clients have communicated acceptance of the proposed sliding scale arrangement for Mr. Duby's fees.
- 4. I have detected various errors in the files of the transferred clients, including missed limitation periods and claims that have not been served despite being issued years prior. One lawsuit has been commenced against Mr. Duby so far. Attached hereto and marked as Exhibit "B" to this my affidavit is a true copy of the Statement of Claim in respect of the lawsuit.
- 5. I have reviewed the files and note that settlements were reached in respect of 2 of the transferred clients. Both of these transferred clients wished to review Mr. Duby's account for fees and disbursements and accordingly our office requested these from Mr. Hogan, counsel for the Receiver, on August 4, 2022. Instead of providing this required information, Mr. Hogan asked me for particulars of my fee arrangement with these clients and the particulars of settlement, neither of which are relevant to Mr. Duby's account for work done. Attached hereto and marked as Exhibit "A" is a true copy of the emails between our office and Mr. Hogan.
- 6. I have been able to contact most of the transferred clients to inform them of these proceedings but cannot confirm whether they are all aware of the scheduled court date in October, nor can I confirm whether they can all attend.
- 7. The Receiver appears, by its actions, to be attempting to bypass Mr. Duby's obligation to account to the transferred clients and to follow the procedures under the *Solicitor's Act* for dealing with his accounts by purporting to unilaterally impose a fee arrangement

on our firm with the transferred clients, so that the transferred clients' rights under the *Solicitor's Act* are no longer directly an issue.

8. From my conversations with Mr. Alexanian and review of the client files, I can confirm that our firm is unwilling to continue as a lawyer for all of the transferred clients, and

if the proposed sliding scale is imposed, we cannot continue to act for all of them.

9. I have reviewed the files and spoken to Mr. Alexanian and do verily believe that the

actions of the Receiver have created a conflict between Mr. Alexanian and the

transferred clients. Specifically, our firm opposes the imposition of the sliding fee

structure. The transferred clients have their own interests which are in conflict with the

interests of our firm, since we are not prepared to continue on all of the files if the

sliding fee structure is imposed, and I do verily believe that these transferred clients

will have trouble securing alternate counsel, and in any event will no longer be able to

be represented by our firm.

10. Due to this conflict, Mr. Alexanian cannot represent both the interests of the transferred

clients at the upcoming hearing and the firms and wishes to bring this issue to the

attention of this Court at the hearing.

SWORN BEFORE ME at the City of Toronto,	
the Province of Ontario this twenty-eighth day	
of September, 2022.	
Shahen Alexanian	) Parisa B.
A Commissioner for taking Affidavits, etc.	) PARISA BABADI

This is Exhibit "A" to the affidavit of Parisa Babadi, sworn September 28, 2022

Shahen Alexanian

A Commissioner, etc.



#### Re: FW: Undertaking [IWOV-HPMain.FID544296]

1 messac

Shahen A. Alexanian <shahen@alexanianlaw.ca>
To: Tim Hogan <thogan@harrisonpensa.com>
Cc: Matthew Lem <matthew.lem@mnp.ca>

Thu, Aug 4, 2022 at 10:06 AM

Hi Tin

My arrangement with my client is confidential and in any event not relevant to Mr. Duby's account for work done. If you are having trouble reconstructing his account, I ask that you please at least give a ballpark estimate of reasonable fees based on the status of the action (which you are aware of as evidenced below) and I can seek instructions from my client regarding payment. I understand your position and am not asking you for precise dockets - just provide a reasonable fee based on the stage of the action (as well as disbursements) and I can see if my clients will agree so that we can resolve this.

(without prejudice)

(/without prejudice)

Please let me know, thanks,

Shahen A. Alexanian Alexanian Law Firm 103 - 1018 Finch Ave. W. Toronto, ON M3J 3L5 T: 416-888-1500 F: 416-888-5070 E: shahen@alexanianlaw.ca

On Thu, Aug 4, 2022 at 9:52 AM Tim Hogan <thogan@harrisonpensa.com> wrote:

Shahen

On both matters, please advise the terms of the settlement amounts and what your firm/MK Legal's fee will be as new counsel?

Pursuant to your previous email of 14 March 2022, the status of the Mate file when transferred was that discoveries were completed. This file was advanced by BDPC.

Once we have the above information in hand we can review and respond.

From: Shahen A. Alexanian <shahen@alexanianlaw.ca> Sent: Tuesday, August 2, 2022 12:33 PM To: Tim Hogan <thogan@harrisonpensa.com> Subject: Undertaking

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Mr. Hogan:

I have settled the tort files for Tsintadze and Mate. At this time, I ask for your statement of account. Thanks. Regards,

Shahen A. Alexanian

Alexanian Law Firm

103 - 1018 Finch Ave. W.

Toronto, ON M3J 3L5

T: 416-888-1500

F: 416-888-5070

E: shahen@alexanianlaw.ca

This is Exhibit "B" to the affidavit of Parisa Babadi, sworn September 28, 2022

Shahen Alexanian

A Commissioner, etc.

Court File No:



## ONTARIO SUPERIOR COURT OF JUSTICE

#### RANDY REID

**Plaintiff** 

-and-

#### BRADLEY DUBY and BRAD DUBY PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

**Defendants** 

#### STATEMENT OF CLAIM

#### TO THE DEFENDANTS:

A LEGAL PROCEEDING HAS BEEN COMMENCED AGAINST YOU by the Plaintiff. The claim made against you is set out in the following pages.

IF YOU WISH TO DEFEND THIS PROCEEDING, you or an Ontario lawyer acting for you must prepare a Statement of Defense in Form 18A prescribed by the *Rules of Civil Procedure*, serve it on the Plaintiff's lawyer, or, where the Plaintiff does not have a lawyer, serve it on the Plaintiff, and file it, with proof of service, in this court office, WITHIN TWENTY DAYS after this Statement of Claim is served on you, if you are served in Ontario.

If you are served in another Province or Territory of Canada, or the United States of America, the period for serving and filing your Statement of Defense is forty days. If you are served outside Canada or the United States of America, the period for serving and filing your Statement of Defense is sixty days.

Instead of serving and filing a Statement of Defense, you may file a Notice of Intent to Defend in form 18B prescribed by the *Rules of Civil Procedure*. This will entitle you to ten more days in which to serve and file your Statement of Defense.

IF YOU FAIL TO DEFEND THIS PROCEEDING, JUDGEMENT MAY BE GIVEN AGAINST YOU IN YOUR ABSENCE AND WITHOUT FURTHER NOTICE TO YOU. IF YOU WISH TO DEFEND THIS PROCEEDING BUT ARE UNABLE TO PAY LEGAL FEES, LEGAL AID MAY BE AVAILABLE TO YOU BY CONTACTING A LOCAL LEGAL AID OFFICE.

\_

IF YOU PAY THE PLAINTIFF'S CLAIM, and \$750 for costs, within the time for serving and filing your Statement of Defence, you may move to have this proceeding dismissed by the Court. If you believe the amount claimed for costs is excessive, you may pay the Plaintiff's claim and \$400 for costs and have the costs assessed by the Court.

TAKE NOTICE: THIS ACTION WILL AUTOMATICALLY BE DISMISSED if it has not been set down for trial or terminated by any means within five years after the action was commenced unless otherwise ordered by the Court.

Date	, 2022	Issued By:
		Local Registrar
		Address of Court Office:
		393 University Avenue 10 <sup>th</sup> Floor Toronto, ON

TO: BRADLEY DUBY
2 Clinton Place
Toronto, ON M6G 1J9

10101110, 011 11100 117

TO: BRAD DUBY PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION 2 Clinton Place Toronto, ON M6G 1J9 **CLAIM** 

#### RELIEF CLAIMED

- 1. The Plaintiff claims against the Defendants for the following:
  - a) General and special damages in the sum of \$500,000.00;
  - b) Pre- and post-judgment interest pursuant to the *Courts of Justice Act*, R.S.O. 1990, c. C.43;
  - c) His costs of this action and the Harmonized Sales Tax on costs; and
  - d) Such further and other relief as this Honorable Court deems just.

#### THE PARTIES

- 2. The Plaintiff resides in the City of Toronto, the Province of Ontario.
- 3. The Defendant, Bradley Duby, was at all material times a lawyer licensed to practice law in Ontario and has an office address in the City of Toronto, the Province of Ontario.
- 4. The Defendant, Brad Duby Professional Corporation, is a law or legal services professional corporation incorporated pursuant to the laws of Ontario having an office address in the City of Toronto.

#### THE INCIDENT AND ITS AFTERMATH

- 5. The Plaintiff was injured in a motor vehicle accident on or around January 21, 2017 (the "MVA") and claimed long-term disability benefits from his insurance carrier, Industrial Alliance (IA).
- 6. The Plaintiff retained the Defendants to commence a lawsuit against the parties at fault for the MVA and against IA for denial of his long-term disability benefits, which denial of benefits occurred on or around March 3, 2017 (the "Denial Date").

т

- 7. In March 2020, three years after the Denial Date and outside of the limitation period, the Defendants issued a Statement of Claim against IA. The Defendants did not at any time disclose to the Plaintiff that they had missed the applicable limitation period.
- 8. A few months later, the Plaintiff retained a new lawyer, who after receiving a copy of the file of the Defendants discovered that the limitation period had been missed in August 2020. The Plaintiff was not aware that the limitation period was missed until August 2020, when his lawyer discovered the error.

#### ALLEGATIONS OF NEGLIGENCE

- 9. The Plaintiff states that the Defendants, in discharging their duties to the Plaintiff, failed to meet the standard of care expected of a lawyer in the circumstances. Specifically, but without limiting the generality of the foregoing, the Plaintiff alleges that the Defendants was negligent in the following respects:
  - (a) they failed to issue the lawsuit against IA within the applicable limitation period.

#### DESCRIPTION OF LOSSES

- 10. As a result of the negligence of the Defendants, the Plaintiff has been unable to recover disability benefits from IA for the injuries he sustained in the MVA since he has lost his right to sue. Mr. Reid has not returned to work as of the date of issuance of this action and claims all lost disability benefits from the Defendants.
- 11. As a result of the negligence of the Defendants, the Plaintiff has suffered other pecuniary damages up to the present and will continue to suffer pecuniary damages in the future, the full particulars of which are not known at this time.
- 12. The Plaintiff further seeks a disgorgement of any legal fees charged by the Defendants in the performance of their work for the Plaintiff.

J

## PLEADING STATUTES

13. The Plaintiff pleads and relies upon the provisions of the *Negligence Act*, R.S.O. 1990, c. N-1, as amended.

## PLACE OF TRIAL

14. The Plaintiff proposes that this action be tried at the City of Toronto, in the Province of Ontario.

DATED: , 2022 ALEXANIAN LAW FIRM

1018 Finch Avenue West

Suite 103

Toronto, ON M3J 3L5

Shahen A. Alexanian LSUC No. 50158J

Tel: 416-888-1500

Email: shahen@alexanianlaw.ca

Counsel for the Plaintiff

Court File No.

REID - and - DUBY et al.

Plaintiff Defendants

## **SUPERIOR COURT OF JUSTICE**

Proceeding commenced at Toronto

## STATEMENT OF CLAIM

ALEXANIAN LAW FIRM 1018 Finch Avenue West Suite 103 Toronto, ON M3J 3L5

Shahen A. Alexanian LSUC No. 50158J Tel: 416-888-1500

Email: shahen@alexanianlaw.ca

Counsel for the Plaintiff

## ONTARIO SUPERIOR COURT OF JUSTICE

Proceeding commenced at TORONTO

## AFFIDAVIT OF PARISA BABADI

ALEXANIAN LAW FIRM 1018 Finch Avenue West Suite 103 Toronto, ON M3J 3L5

Shahen A. Alexanian LSUC#: 50158J

Tel: 416-888-1500 Fax: 416-888-5070

Non-Party

# ONTARIO SUPERIOR COURT OF JUSTICE

Proceeding commenced at TORONTO

## RESPONDING MOTION RECORD

ALEXANIAN LAW FIRM 1018 Finch Avenue West Suite 103 Toronto, ON M3J 3L5

Shahen A. Alexanian LSUC#: 50158J

Tel: 416-888-1500 Fax: 416-888-5070